



Focused Assessment of Balsu's “In a Nutshell” Program

July 2023
Focused Assessment

ABOUT THE FAIR LABOR ASSOCIATION

The Fair Labor Association (FLA) promotes human rights at work. We are an international network of companies, universities, and civil society organizations collaborating to ensure that millions of people working at the world's factories and farms are paid fairly and protected from risks to their health, safety, and well-being.

Table of Contents

- 1. Executive Summary 3
- 2. Abbreviations and Acronyms..... 5
- 3. Introduction 6
 - 3.1 Background 6
 - 3.2 Methodology 6
 - 3.3 Overview of Program Activities 8
- 4. Evaluation of Activities and Strategy (“Looking Back”) 10
 - 4.1 Program Activities Targeting Group Needs and Child Labor Prevention 10
 - 4.2 Effectiveness of the Program 14
 - 4.3 Collaboration under the Program 20
 - 4.4 Efficiency of the Program 20
 - 4.5 Impact of the Program 22
 - 4.6 Lessons Learned 23
- 5. Conclusion and Recommendations (“Looking Ahead”) 24
- 6. Annex 1 26

1. Executive Summary

Since 2014, Balsu has operated a farm-level monitoring program, “In a Nutshell,” in line with Fair Labor Association (FLA) standards and in cooperation with the Young Lives Foundation (YLF). This focused assessment report covers site observations of 2022’s harvest activities, conducted where seasonal migration workers originate within the framework of Balsu’s labor monitoring and remediation program.

The purpose of the assessment was to:

1. Evaluate and reflect on past activities, successes, challenges, and effectiveness of program indicators (“Looking Back”) and;
2. Provide recommendations and analysis for the remaining strategic orientation (“Looking Ahead”).

“In a Nutshell” aims to eradicate child labor in the hazelnut harvesting sector by conducting internal monitoring, facilitating access to education, providing age-appropriate education and workshops, and creating safe spaces for children who cannot attend summer schools.¹ The program also seeks to raise local and national awareness and inspire the development of a sustainable model for combatting child labor. It covers where many seasonal workers originate – five cities in the Black Sea region (Düzce, Giresun, Sakarya, Samsun, and Ordu), and two cities in southeastern Türkiye (Diyarbakır and Mardin).

The assessment team visited the Black Sea region cities to observe and evaluate the hazelnut harvest activities in September 2022, and visited the cities in southeastern Türkiye during the workers’ off-season of November 2022. The team also visited two schools in Sakarya and three schools in Diyarbakır and Mardin, conducted eight workshops with children from seasonal migrant worker families, and collected data from 140 people. Based on a detailed analysis of the data, the assessment’s main findings and recommendations are as follows:

1. The program provides training activities for children at risk of child labor in hazelnut harvesting areas as part of a holistic approach to education and monitors their education in their city of origin.
2. The program successfully reached the targeted number of children.
3. The program was highly successful and effective in building partnerships with stakeholders, including families, agricultural intermediaries, and heads of villages.

¹ “Safe spaces” are areas where children are protected from healthcare risks, such as sunstroke and insect or snakebites, with shade and access to drinking water. At least one adult supervises children in the safe spaces.

4. Measuring the program's medium- and long-term impact in eliminating child labor requires qualitative and quantitative data (indicators on school achievement, absence, and schooling status over time).
5. The program has limitations in preventing child labor due to the mobile nature of seasonal migrant workers.

FLA suggests the following actions to improve the farm-level monitoring, child labor prevention, and remediation program:

1. **Continue to promote education** as a strategy for child labor elimination, conduct further mobile workshops and summer schools, and address program limitations in outreach to children most at risk for child labor.
2. **Build up transparent and efficient communication channels** and enhance cooperation with other initiatives on child labor elimination to increase program efficiency.
3. **Strengthen child monitoring activities in home cities** and enhance cooperation with the Ministry of National Education's district commissions to monitor the school attendance of seasonal workers' children in different cities.
4. **Facilitate a communication or dialogue** between schools and teachers from the Black Sea region and Diyarbakir and Mardin.
5. **Promote collaboration among public authorities** to improve temporary settlement areas.
6. **Explore opportunities for future engagement of participating children** in subsequent cycles and ensure the continuity of educational services.
7. Consider **using workers' profile data** in future programming, following up on child labor trends, and increasing synergies between child labor elimination activities and internal monitoring.
8. **Create impact indicators and an exit strategy** for the medium to long-term program.

2. Abbreviations and Acronyms

Development Assistance Committee – DAC

The Fair Labor Association – FLA

Monitoring Evaluation Accountability and Learning – MEAL

METIP – Mevsimlik Gezici Tarım İşçilerinin Çalışma ve Yaşam Koşullarının İyileştirilmesi (Project for Improvement of the Working and Living Conditions of Seasonal Migratory Agricultural Workers)

non-governmental organizations – NGOs

OECD – Organisation for Economic Co-operation Development

Türkiye İş Kurumu – İSKUR

The Young Lives Foundation – YLF

3. Introduction

In addition to the farm-level monitoring program, “In a Nutshell,” Balsu also participates in the remediation-focused FLA project, “Harvesting the Future,” which aims to improve working conditions across various agricultural commodity production and collection fields. FLA members undergo annual independent external assessments to measure and report progress.

This focused assessment was conducted between August and November 2022 as an annual independent external assessment.

3.1 Background

Since 2014, “In a Nutshell” has aimed to eradicate the use of child labor for harvesting hazelnuts through various intervention models, such as internal monitoring and facilitating access to safe spaces and age-appropriate education. In addition, the program also seeks to raise awareness in the growing hazelnut regions and throughout Türkiye to help influence the development of a sustainable model for more widely combatting child labor.

Through their strategic partnership, YLF and Balsu are committed to mobilizing public institutions on preventing child labor at the national and local levels; increasing awareness of the labor rights of seasonal workers and the risk of child labor; empowering women, families, seasonal workers, and local agricultural intermediaries through training programs; and providing in-kind support for families and scholarships for children.

3.2 Methodology

This focused assessment was conducted between August and November 2022, with questions prepared by FLA based on the Organisation for Economic Co-operation and Development's (OECD) Development Assistance Committee (DAC) criteria.

The assessment process involved the YLF program team, Balsu's sustainability team, the target group (children and their families), and the project's primary stakeholders (public authority representatives, school administration, and agricultural intermediaries). Independent consultants Aşiyen Süleymanoğlu and Tuğba Sevim conducted the evaluation. The focused assessment aims to combine retrospective analysis of results and activities, along with a contribution to the strategic forecast for the program — specifically to:

- Assess the overall effectiveness of “In a Nutshell” based on the changes made in the program since the 2021 harvest (August–September 2021).

- Evaluate activities conducted during the 2022 harvest in the Black Sea region.
- Explore the link between the activities undertaken in the cities of origin between Winter 2021 and Spring 2022 and the 2022 harvest activities.

The scope of the evaluation encompasses all activities and components implemented by the program from November 1, 2021 to the end of November 2022. The team addressed the evaluation questions using multiple sources of evidence and used the following qualitative research methods to collect the information:

i. Desk Review

The evaluation team reviewed and obtained the Monitoring Evaluation Accountability and Learning (MEAL) report on 2021–2022 origin activities, the MEAL report of harvest 2022, information on scholarship programs, satisfaction surveys of families and children, agendas of teacher orientation programs 2021–2022, and the women’s needs analysis report. All the documents mentioned were developed by YLF.

ii. Key Informant Interviews

In-depth interviews were held, relying on stakeholders with firsthand knowledge of the program’s operations and context to gather additional information for a better understanding of the strategy, implementation approach, processes, and perceptions of the target groups. One hundred and forty people were interviewed.

Table 1: Key Informants Interviewed

Group	Interviews
Seasonal workers (families)	46
Public institutions (Ministry of National Education, district governors, village heads)	27
Children	15
YLF (implementing partner)	14
Teachers (including school heads and principals)	13
Agricultural labor intermediaries	12
Farmers	10
Balsu	3
Total	140

iii. Focus Groups

Focus group discussions covered 58 participants (seasonal workers, families, children, teachers, and agricultural labor intermediaries).

iv. Site Visits

Between September 1 and 7, 2022, the team visited Düzce, Giresun, Ordu, Sakarya, and Samsun to observe mobile workshops, school activities, and temporary settlement areas. The evaluation team also visited seasonal workers in schools in their cities of origin, Diyarbakır and Mardin, between November 8 and 11, 2022.

v. Limitations

The implementing partner is the primary point of contact for program activities in the field (including local authorities and workers). Implementing partner representatives were often present during the meetings with stakeholders, which meant that, the discussions were not held in a genuinely confidential environment and the selection of the interviewees was not conducted independently. Summer school activities were completed just prior to the start of the evaluation, and the workshops were ongoing during the focused assessment, meaning the team could only observe one of the workshops. One focus group discussion was conducted with six children aged 9–13, with the team attending the school activities in the Black Sea Region to evaluate the experience of this age group. The number of families and children was also limited during the site visits to Mardin and Diyarbakır, where the evaluation team interviewed nine children. At the time of these visits, most families and children were still traveling to or staying in other regions and had not yet returned to their cities of origin.

vi. Analysis of Data and Reporting

Information from interviews, surveys, and quantitative data from YLF was analyzed and triangulated. The findings were then formulated based on the collected and validated data.

3.3 Overview of Program Activities

“In a Nutshell” seeks to eradicate child labor in hazelnut harvesting through internal monitoring, facilitating access to education, providing children with age-appropriate education, and creating safe spaces. This program also looks to serve as a sustainable model for challenging child labor practices by raising local and national awareness.

The program was designed and implemented in two parts. Winter activities, from January 11, 2021, to May 5, 2022, are listed below.

1. YLF visited households in Diyarbakır and Mardin to identify children for winter activities and register them in the child monitoring system. Of the 501 children from 209 households, 46% were newly registered, while 54% attended the harvest activities in August and September 2021. One-hundred and forty-one children received scholarships from Balsu and YLF to continue their education in their home cities.
2. YLF dispatched a field coordinator (male) and a field officer (female) to each household, in accommodation of the region's gender dynamics, to register families, conduct information sessions, and manage education referrals.
3. One hundred and twenty women in Diyarbakır and Mardin participated in women's health and hygiene trainings.
4. Public institutions and representatives, including the governor, governor's office, district education boards, social security offices, public education centers, development agencies, and schools, were visited in Mardin and Diyarbakır.
5. Thirty agricultural labor intermediaries attended the agricultural labor intermediary training and were certified by Türkiye İş Kurumu (ISKUR).
6. Thirty opinion leaders and stakeholders (including farm owners, heads of villages, and agronomists) in the harvest regions visited Diyarbakır and Mardin from March 15 to 17, 2022.
7. The program created a short film called "Dicle," to promote intercultural dialogue. The film was used during the training and circulated on social media.
8. Eight teachers from the Black Sea region and nine from Diyarbakır and Mardin participated in teacher orientation trainings.

Summer activities were completed between July 1 and September 12, 2022.

1. YLF visited 1,321 families and identified 3,149 children in five cities; 63% of children worked in hazelnut harvesting.
2. During the 2022 harvest, 3,146 educational sessions were held, and 2,500 children participated in educational activities.
3. YLF monitored 2,047 children until September 30, 2022.
4. YLF identified 386 children who participated in both the 2021 and 2022 summer educational activities.

The program focused on children of seasonal migrant workers and at-risk children ages 6 to 17; however, it also used a multi-stakeholder and supply chain approach to target hazelnut farmers, village heads, agricultural labor intermediaries, seasonal workers,

teachers, schools, public institutions, governors, and non-governmental organizations (NGOs).

4. Evaluation of Activities and Strategy (“Looking Back”)

4.1 Program Activities Targeting Group Needs and Child Labor Prevention

Children engaged in seasonal agriculture face various risks, particularly concerning their safety, when they travel with their parents for long periods of time (between one to eight months). Even when children do not work, they live in temporary settlement areas which lack basic infrastructure and adult supervision during working hours. These children often need to maintain regular school attendance and are left having to catch up academically.

Within this context, the program planned a series of activities and initiatives for the harvest period, including mobile workshops, summer schools, in-kind support and scholarships to promote educational attainment for children at risk of child labor. Mobile workshops and summer schools provide a safe space for children who would have been either brought to the production areas or left behind in the common settlement areas without adult supervision. During the evaluation, all stakeholders agreed that the program successfully identified and referred children to these educational activities and provided safe spaces, minimizing the risks to children’s health and safety.

When referring children to school, the program emphasizes educational enrollment and engages with all relevant actors, including families, agricultural intermediaries, teachers, and local authorities. This approach is all-inclusive since there are many actors involved in protecting children and ensuring continuity of education.

However, the program model has limitations in addressing child labor among the highest risk group, ensuring their engagement with program activities, and promoting to them the benefits of schooling. The risk of child labor is often highest among children between the ages of 14 and 17.

According to the YLF’s 2022 harvest report, among the 3,139 children identified in the regions studied, 1,987 (63%) worked during the 2022 harvest. Although YLF reached out to more children and further engaged with program activities in 2022, there was still a significant increase in child labor. According to labor contractors and workers, this is mainly due to increasing poverty attributable to the continuing economic downturn and high inflation in Türkiye.

Table 2: Children Working/Not Working in 2022 Seasonal Agriculture Activities

Age group	Sex (not working)		Total	Sex (working)		Total
	Girl	Boy		Girl	Boy	
0 to 5	58	57	115 (10%)	1	0	1 (<1%)
6 to 9	339	357	696 (60%)	35	62	97 (5%)
10 to 13	148	159	307 (27%)	452	411	863 (43%)
14 to 17	14	15	29 (2.5%)	541	478	1,019 (51%)
N/A	3	2	5 (<1%)	3	4	7 (<1%)
Total	562	590	1,152 (100%)	1,032	955	1,987 (100%)

The focused assessment visits and interviews with families, children, and teachers highlighted that children between the ages of 14 and 17 are more likely than children between the ages of 10 and 13 to work in seasonal agricultural activities, and accordingly, their participation in program activities is comparatively lower. Nevertheless, more than half of the interviewed families confirmed that their children (ages 12 to 18) worked during the 2022 harvest.

The YLF reports that children working in the hazelnut harvest attended an average of 7.7 educational activities, while children participating in seasonal agriculture but not working participated in an average of 13.8 educational activities. Furthermore, participation in educational activities decreases as children get older.

Table 3: Children's Attendance in Educational Activities

Age group	Number of activities
5 to 9	13.9
10 to 13	9.7
14 to 17	6.8

The program identified 2,774 children, 1,572 (57%) working during the 2021 harvest. In 2022, 3,149 children were identified, with 63% stating they had worked in the 2022 harvest. Giresun had the highest rate of working children (90%) among those who attended educational activities, whereas Ordu had the lowest (60%).

Table 4: Children Working/Not Working in 2021 and 2022 Seasonal Agriculture Activities

Working status	Children identified in 2021		Total	Children identified in 2022		Total
	Girl	Boy		Girl	Boy	
Working	812	760	1572	1032	955	1987
Not working	577	600	1,177	562	590	1,152
N/A	13	12	25	8	2	10
Total	1,402	1,362	2,774	1,602	1,547	3,149

Box 1: Respondents’ Statements on Child Labor

One 45-year-old seasonal worker, a woman interviewed in Mardin, stated: “We go to the Black Sea region every year for hazelnut harvesting and stay more than a month. This year, our youngest child (13) attended the workshops and the others (14 to 19) worked with us. We all have to work, as living costs have increased a lot. The garden owners don’t check ages, and children over age 11 are allowed to collect hazelnuts.”

Another seasonal worker (a 52-year-old man interviewed in Ordu), added: “Our one-way transportation to the harvest region cost 7,500 Turkish lira (TRY), and the return trip will cost more – maybe even close to TRY15,000. Though we don’t want our children to work, living costs are so high and we don’t have any other jobs when we return. My 14-year-old worked with us all summer. If I get paid a bit more, I won’t bring her with me. She can sleep comfortably at home – here she stays in a tent.”

Finally, an agriculture labor intermediary (a 52-year-old man interviewed in Mardin), noted: “Children ages 10 and up harvest hazelnuts in the summer. I have 250 workers, and finding workers is difficult. Families live in terrible conditions. The economy is getting worse every day, and costs are increasing. We know that child labor is not good, but most families have no other choice; if we don’t allow children to work, the families refuse to come – so we allow them. Farm owners did not stop children from working, but some did not pay for their labor.”

There are also several challenges in addressing the education needs of the children in seasonal agriculture, particularly the high-risk group between ages of 11 to 18.

First, their schooling status is diverse: some children were already out of the formal school system (of the 385 children without school enrollment, 229 stated that they had dropped out in 2022). In addition, other child groups faced further challenges regarding access to education. For instance, there were 19 children of different nationalities under temporary protection and 130 children with disabilities or other additional needs. Furthermore, the language barrier exacerbates challenges faced in accessing and continuing education for non-native Turkish speaking children. In such a context, the

activities conducted in the safe spaces need to differ based on the children's age, gender, origin, schooling status, and the city in which they permanently reside.

The project's extensive winter activities complemented the program's 2022 harvest activities, including:

- Reading and writing classes for women;
- Courses on violence against women and women's legal rights;
- Awareness sessions on social security rights, financial literacy, children and development periods, positive parenting education, technical writing, and role-model meetings.

Despite this, stakeholders noted that while mobilizing and sensitizing social actors increases certain awareness levels of child labor, the lack of educational opportunities, in-kind benefits, and counseling support means that there is a limited impact in addressing the complex root causes of child labor, especially poverty.

Given transportation costs and other living expenses, unless a child is responsible for taking care of younger siblings, their families often consider their presence an additional expense. Nevertheless, the families and children welcomed the incentives, as in-kind support contributed (to some extent) to the family's income and encouraged them to send their children to school.

During the interviews, seasonal migrant workers raised concerns about the conditions of their accommodations, specifically related to hygiene and access to water and electricity. They also highlighted the need for better living conditions in all types of accommodations (houses provided by the hazelnut farmer or tents in temporary settlement areas).

According to the YLF 2022 Harvest MEAL Report, seasonal workers defined the three most challenging aspects of harvesting as working conditions, transportation, and living conditions.² The workers also emphasized other grievances regarding long working hours, low wages, limited breaks during harvest, and unsafe working conditions.

² The Fair Labor Association. (2022, 14 September). "In a Nutshell": Efficacy of Balsu's Child Protection Program. <https://www.fairlabor.org/reports/in-a-nutshell/>

Box 2: Respondents' Statements on Labor Conditions

A seasonal worker told interviewers: "We came to Ordu in August and worked nearly 28 days; we could not work during the three or four rainy days. When our clothes got dirty and wet in the storm, we asked the farm owners to help wash them, but no one let us use their washing machine. People only care about money. The farm owners don't look at our faces or ask how we are. We don't see a smiling face for days. However, we have to work," the 54-year-old man said.

A 67-year-old village leader interviewed in Samsun said: "We also worked on hazelnut farms. I brought my children with me – I didn't know then that this was harmful to their development, but now, I do. Balsu came here and trained us." He continued: "I also participated in the winter activities – we paid a visit to workers' hometown. It was beneficial and increased the interaction with seasonal migrant workers. I have discussed with the local community what we can do for the seasonal workers; the accommodations here are getting better. Agricultural labor intermediaries come early to check the accommodation facilities. We started communicating with seasonal workers in March to try to prevent children from working during the harvest. Neither side wants children to work, but the economic situation is challenging. Last year, farmers gave consent for children older than 15 to work."

The teachers and school principals were glad to be participate in the program, reporting that the program activities were highly relevant and beneficial. They emphasized that their knowledge and perspectives about seasonal workers have changed significantly, and they better understand their students' circumstances.

Box 3: Respondents' Statements on Migrant Families and Absenteeism

A teacher and school principal, interviewed in Diyarbakır, said: "We were not aware of children harvesting hazelnuts. We only knew that they would start school two weeks late, since their families were in the Black Sea region for hazelnut harvesting. After the YLF and Balsu visited us last year to explain the "In a Nutshell" program, we understand the conditions and education needs of migrant workers' children. Now we give priority to seasonal workers' children for weekend courses. Absenteeism decreased this year, and we observed positive changes in children who attended the summer educational programs and surveyed their development."

4.2 Effectiveness of the Program

The program successfully reached the target number of children and effectively collaborated with families, agricultural intermediaries, and village heads. According to interviews, assessment surveys, and YLF's family and children satisfaction surveys, the educational programs increased children's willingness to attend school and kept them in the formal education system. The program was also quite successful in its strategies and approaches. Different actors along the hazelnut supply chain were educated through various activities.

Table 5: Distribution of Children by Educational Activities

Harvest province	Children attending school	Children attending activities in accommodation areas	Children attending school and activities in accommodation areas
Düzce	0	525	0
Giresun	0	144	0
Ordu	80	588	41
Sakarya	143	535	82
Samsun	0	362	0
Total	223	2,154	123

Due to the mobile nature of the seasonal migrant workers, it is difficult to ensure educational continuity and prevent children from working long-term. It is also challenging to assess the impact of the educational programs, as different children participate each year.

“In a Nutshell” successfully identified and referred children to mobile workshops and schools and provided safe spaces, minimizing the risks to children’s health and safety. One of the project's most valuable contributions is providing a safe environment for their children. Interviewed families were deeply appreciative of the school programs because they previously had no choice but to leave their children alone or bring them to work. The project helped alleviate their concerns about their children’s safety as they were at school and being watched by teachers.

Box 4: Respondents’ Statements on Mobile Workshops and Education

Interviewed in Samsun, a 38-year-old woman said: “We have been coming to harvest hazelnuts for more than five years. We found the program quite useful. In these workshops, the children were prepared and motivated for school, and spent time with other children.”

A 39-year-old mother, working seasonally in Ordu, said: “My youngest child is seven; she attends the mobile workshops. She listens to music, plays with her friends, and paints. The YLF staff gave her books and notebooks, and I do not need to bring her to the hazelnut farms, as I know she is in good hands and the teachers take care of her well.”

A 13-year-old girl, interviewed at Konoklu School, noted: “The lectures are fun here, not like in our hometowns. We watch movies, do musical activities, play games, practice math, and solve tests, which isn’t dull like our formal education. We don’t like to work on hazelnut farms; the hours are long and the farm owners do not let us go without finishing all the work on the farm.”

Additionally, the YLF field staff had the necessary language skills, which interviewees indicate significantly helps establish trust with the families and reaching the children. In a survey of children who participated in harvesting and attended Mevlana Halit School’s summer educational activities, all shared positive comments about their school activities. During the assessment visits, children and their families said they enjoyed educational activities and liked their teachers. School principals and teachers in Mardin and Diyarbakır highlighted the children’s positive response toward summer schools. Families and children appreciated the winter educational activities programs, as they could follow up on their classes without feeling behind.

The program has limitations in keeping children out of work. Families are more likely to send their children (6 to 10 years old) to workshops compared to adolescents (11 to 17 years old). Also, during the assessment process, most interviewed families and children noted that they attended education activities during rainy days when the harvest work stops. The YLF field staff said they encourage the families and garden owners to send their children to safe spaces while garden work is ongoing.

Table 6: Children’s 2021 and 2022 Participation in Harvest and Education

	Working Status	Participation in Educational Activities		Total
		Participated	Did not participate	
2021	Worked	87	14	101
	Did not work	253	26	279
	N/A	2	4	6
Total		342	44	386
2022	Worked	195	59	254
	Did not work	115	17	132
Total		310	76	386

The program team could monitor children after the harvest, yet its effects in promoting education through referral to formal education were limited. The YLF field staff reached out to 1,309 families during the 2022 harvest, and 2,047 children were monitored after the harvest. A total of 45 children were referred to formal and non-formal education

centers.³ While formal education includes technical and vocational education and training centers and open high schools, informal education includes learning pathways for out of the school children and adolescents who cannot enter formal education without catching up.

As part of the winter activities, the YLF field staff reached out to 209 households in the 2021-2022 period, and 501 children were monitored until May 2022, while 114 children were referred to the Public Education Centre's courses in their origin cities. During the last two years, 141 children received scholarships from YLF and Balsu and continued their formal education in their places of origin.

The program identified 386 children who were registered both in 2021 and 2022. The YLF reached out to over 5,000 children in the last two years: **approximately 8% of these children participated in the program in both years.** It can also be seen that the percentage of working children among the total number of children accessed has significantly increased. On the other hand, most of these working children (80%) also participated in educational activities in 2022.

Mobile workshops provide flexibility and allow outreach to many children, though this method has areas for improvement in continuity. For example, the educational activities in the schools and the workshops were designed for a seven-day week. But while the former was programmed as full-day activities, the latter was only for one to three hours per day. However, the hazelnut harvest runs for long hours and some families indicated their concern about leaving their children alone after the workshop or school ended.

Both focused assessment survey responses and the family/children satisfaction survey results from YLF noted that although mobile workshops enabled the project to reach remote locations and impact more children, the school programs were much more effective and preferred by the teachers and families. Teachers, families, and children preferred the school programs – which were more structured and longer, with meals provided – to workshops.

However, families who stayed in tents during the harvest preferred educational workshops, creating a safe space in the temporary living areas rather than transferring their children to schools.

³ While formal education includes technical and vocational education and training centers and open high schools, informal education includes learning pathways for children out of school and adolescents who cannot enter formal education without catching up.

Box 5: Respondents' Statements on Mobile Workshop Participation

A 48-year-old seasonal worker, a woman interviewed in Sakarya, said: "We generally identified the times [families attend] the mobile workshops — typically on rainy days. Though the workshops are one to two hours, longer would be better. We would like our children to go to school. They sit at desks there [and...] it feels more secure."

A 13-year-old student interviewed in Diyarbakır) noted: "I attended school in 2021 and some workshops in 2022. I love them. I especially enjoyed drawing. The lessons were fun and useful."

The educational program's duration and mobility pose barriers to monitoring children and preventing child labor. Continuous and consistent educational services are crucial in promoting children's education and preventing child labor. However, the project's educational services are limited to 30 days during summer, covering only the hazelnut harvest season, and children may travel with their families for up to eight months.

Among the interviewed children, several interviewed children indicated that they had worked before the educational programs and would likely work elsewhere before returning to school. In addition, some of the families stated that their children attended the summer academic programs in 2021, and they were in contact again during the 2022 harvest with YLF field staff about sending their children to educational activities. However, they were informed that there is no educational activity by YLF in that area anymore. As a result, some children could not attend any educational activities during the 2022 harvest.

While considered practical and easy to implement by stakeholders, winter and summer activities created by the lifelong learning modules of the Public Education Centre are only partly responsive to children's educational needs. The current training program is tailored for children ages 6 to 15, and presents activities based on the assumption that segregated age groups have similar educational levels and capacities. However, children participating in mobile workshops/schools have different learning levels and come from a range of age groups. Furthermore, mobile workshops/schools operate in an environment where the child profile constantly changes.

Children also have diverse vulnerabilities and needs for different subject-focused training. Due to low attendance, most children are often behind in their studies. International migrant families' children are primarily Arabic-speaking and have limited or no Turkish language skills, which may be an obstacle. Teachers observed bullying, discrimination (among seasonal migrant workers from different cities), and family violence. Therefore, stakeholders stated the need for more tailored training sessions focusing on children about privacy, non-violent communication, and youth mediation.

The 'Training of Trainers' approach of "In a Nutshell" is adequate and comprehensive to reaching the program objectives. The training materials were practical, easy to implement, and met the needs of the participants. In addition, the schoolteachers

described the educational programs as a two-way learning process; they had the opportunity to meet a group of students with whom they had not had teaching experience before, and now they had a better understanding of the seasonal workers, their children's home conditions, and challenges they faced in their schooling.

One of the most valued contributions of the program came via its peer-to-peer learning opportunities. Origin activities and visuals were highly welcomed by the farmers, agricultural labor intermediaries, and workers, helping to change perceptions. The farm owners, heads of villages, and opinion leaders stated that the intercultural exchange site visit resulted in several action plans. Staying in seasonal workers' homes alerted leaders to their assumptions and biases and positively changed their opinions about seasonal workers.

Now they collaborate to provide better living conditions for the seasonal workers during the harvest period. Most stakeholders shared their experiences with their network and community and have already taken steps like renovating accommodation and renewing or providing necessary equipment. Videos of the seasonal workers' children's living conditions and sharing their opinions at training in 2021 were highly influential in influencing the stakeholders.

Box 6: Respondents' Statements on Balsu's Trainings

Interviewed in Diyarbakır, a 52-year-old agricultural intermediary said he has, "...been harvesting hazelnuts for more than 20 years. [He] attended the trainings in Diyarbakır and found [them] very useful. The video they showed, "Dicle," affected me. The garden owners started to change their behavior towards us. They now help with accommodations and transportation costs."

A district manager in Diyarbakır's social security office said: "'In a Nutshell' is essential for this region. We have a many seasonal workers who harvest hazelnuts every year. Balsu is taking the lead in the private sector to mobilize many public institutions. They are doing a great job — we see some positive results, such as increased awareness of child labor in the region. As an institution, we have supported the training of women. In Diyarbakır, 21% of women workers are registered, but most seasonal workers do not have social security. I have attended the agricultural intermediaries' training sessions in Diyarbakır. I watched Dicle (an example of the seasonal workers and their children)."

One of the critical successes of the program in terms of its strategies and approaches is its ability to facilitate different actors along the hazelnut supply chain to become capacitated through various educational programs. As stakeholders frequently pointed out, collaborating with agricultural labor intermediaries is a solid strategic approach, as they can support the reduction of situation concerning child labor and use their networks to facilitate more children's access to educational opportunities.

Through intercultural interaction, "In a Nutshell" has secured alliances with key stakeholders. During the program implementation, YLF and Balsu coordinated several meetings to improve the overall collaboration among various stakeholders, including hazelnut farmers, seasonal workers, and village heads.

4.3 Collaboration under the Program

The program was highly successful and effective in building partnerships with public institutions. Field visits and stakeholder interviews demonstrated the program's contribution to collaboration and cooperation among public institutions, strengthening Balsu's dialogue with public institutions and civil society. Discussions with public institutions underscored the importance of the project by sensitizing the target groups about eliminating child labor. All interviewed stakeholders noted the important roles of Balsu's team, and its implementing partner YLF, in facilitating and raising awareness of child labor.

Migrant workers live below minimum standards, in temporary settlement areas that mostly lack basic infrastructure. The program was not only successful in raising awareness about the elimination of child labor; it also brought attention to the workers' living conditions to the public authorities. The evaluation team observed that certain cities (Düzce – Çilimli; Sakarya – Ferizli) make considerable efforts to improve migrant workers' living conditions. In addition, the local governorates of Düzce, Sakarya, and Samsun have shared their willingness to expand the program's reach and sustainability.

The program has brought together ministries and public authorities and created synergies. As a result, there are more projects concerned with child labor in the region, and joint programming and delivery can potentially reach the expected outcomes. In addition to the Ministry of National Education, public agencies like the Ministry of Youth and Sports and the Ministry of Culture and Tourism have increased their support and activities with private partnerships in the hazelnut supply chain.

Although Balsu has been participating actively in “Harvesting the Future,” there is room for growth in practical cooperation and coordination with other projects in the region and outside hazelnut growing areas. Furthermore, traceability is also relatively low in hazelnuts, and children may work as farmers under the supply chain of different companies.

4.4 Efficiency of the Program

Balsu and YLF have conducted activities and programs on eliminating child labor for a considerable time, collected significant knowledge on the issue, and built a strong network. Successful interventions require a longer commitment and continuous engagement. YLF has been active in the program's piloted cities through different educational programs and projects. The program recognized the importance of regular personal meetings with all stakeholders in implementing the project activities. Balsu and YLF have benefitted from the vast resources, knowledge, and network links gained from their experience in the regions. Despite some challenges, the program also initiated active engagement with governmental agencies, and the program activities were delivered as planned with some promising results.

Over the last two years of implementation, the program has produced many training materials for teachers, case studies, brochures, and posters, which reached a considerable number of stakeholders in all areas of intervention. YLF shared information with a wide range of target groups on social media and produced a short video that was highly efficient in promoting intercultural dialogue.

The program can potentially increase efficiency and impact through direct engagement with other initiatives and projects. For example, during the interviews with public institution representatives, the team learned that many industries, such as schools and summer courses, were financed by the private sector and NGOs in the region.

Despite the hazelnut market's competitiveness and short harvest time, there is room for improvement in coordination and cooperation at all levels to use private sector resources effectively and ensure and support children's access to services.

The program's monitoring focuses mainly on tracking the management of the program activities. In contrast, YLF records the achievement of the educational activities in terms of the number of children monitored through the tracking system and database, the number of families/children who received incentives, and those who attended the training and awareness-raising activities. The YLF field team and management team, including the MEAL officer, is in close contact with Balsu's sustainability department. YLF and its satisfaction surveys confirm that YLF receives regular feedback from all stakeholders.

Extensive information on children and families is collected by YLF field staff; while it can be crucial in identifying potential risks and future challenges, it is underutilized. The MEAL report data shows that YLF identified 13.5% more children in the field in 2022 (3,149) than there were in 2021 (2,774). Furthermore, in 2021, 56% of identified children stated they were working, while this rate increased to 63% the following year. Finally, the 2022 MEAL report shows that 192 children's contact people were agricultural intermediaries. This suggests that their family members had not accompanied them during the harvest, which is a potential risk signal for Balsu.

Qualitative and quantitative data must be collected to measure the program's medium- to long-term impact in eliminating child labor, and several critical indicators must be included in the monitoring. After the 2022 harvest, 2,047 children have been monitored by the YLF field team via phone calls and visits. Despite the monitoring activities, school principals noted seasonal workers' children still have a high absentee rate. The number of transfers to schools after the summer educational program ended was also limited. Enhanced efforts are needed to support the children's educational attainment and monitoring. Impact-oriented monitoring requires a combination of qualitative and quantitative indicators. The YLF field team should follow up on school achievement, absence, and schooling status to measure the program's long-term impact.

Enhanced efforts are needed to support the children's educational attainment and monitoring. The “In a Nutshell” program may consider including qualitative indicators in the system. Impact-oriented monitoring requires a combination of qualitative and quantitative indicators. For example, it is possible to track from the YLF’s MEAL reports how many children were registered in harvesting in 2021–2022 and how many attended the educational activities, worked, or did not work. Segregated data on school and mobile workshops (such as average educational activity at school and mobile workshops separately with age breakdown) would be beneficial to assess the mobile workshops and school programs. The focused assessment could not find evidence of how YLF and BALSU interpreted and used the collected data.

Finally, grassroots-level coordination between child labor policies and interventions and other welfare and poverty alleviation programs are limited. This is mainly due to service and project mapping. Some stakeholders are becoming increasingly aware of the need for and challenges of sustainable solutions to ensure and uphold children’s rights. However, data collection, disaggregation, and sharing remain problematic across various activities, providing and assisting children’s access to services and support from when they leave their residence until their return. There is room for improvement in coordination and cooperation at all levels and between various sectors.

4.5 Impact of the Program

Although the program met its target numbers, the team identified several challenges in achieving overall program outcomes. Seasonal migrant agricultural workers have been deeply affected by increasing poverty related to Türkiye's current economic downturn and high inflation. Their livelihoods are highly dependent on daily labor, and increasing prices put more pressure on children to work. Although parents stated that their children should continue their education instead of working, financial hardship sometimes requires child labor. The COVID-19 pandemic created new challenges, including as access to healthcare, education, and welfare support. Stakeholders confirmed that distance learning has made it even more difficult for children to access education.

Additionally, in the last two years, some METIP – Mevsimlik Gezici Tarım İşçilerinin Çalışma ve Yaşam Koşullarının İyileştirilmesi (Project for Improvement of the Working and Living Conditions of Seasonal Migratory Agricultural Workers) areas were changed or closed in the target cities, while new METIP areas could not yet be identified for the closed ones. Therefore, seasonal workers were spread across the harvest cities, which posed another challenge in identifying workers, referring their children to educational activities, and monitoring families during the harvest.

The program successfully provided safe spaces for children, which positively impacts their health and safety. “In a Nutshell” also promotes educational attainment and helps children to stay in school and acquire valuable social skills. The current program model serves its purpose well by facilitating planning, coordination, and monitoring activities at provincial and national levels. In addition, based on the interviews, the program has

achieved progress regarding awareness-raising on child labor, especially among public institutions. However, the program is at an early stage still, and its full impact on childrens' educational and social development – as well as preventing child labor – is yet to be seen. Nevertheless, it is necessary to consider and add relevant indicators and impact methodology and to pilot them before the end of the program.

During the evaluation process, key participants noted legal gaps regarding the rights of seasonal workers and enforcement of the current regulations. Issues about compensation, registration to social security, and working hours also have a considerable effect on the decision of the parents to let their children work. For example, workers cannot leave their children behind if harvests take place at night. Informal work (lack of registration or agricultural intermediaries) and piece-rate compensation may unintentionally encourage workers to bring their children to work in order to earn more money.

The program's strong cooperation with public agencies like social security offices, municipalities, and the Ministry of Labor's provincial and district offices have excellent potential to increase awareness about these issues, with supporting information and data from the field and indirectly affect the policy-making process.

4.6 Lessons Learned

Lessons from the “In a Nutshell” program include:

- **Trust-Building:** Creating an environment of trust among community decision-makers is critical to ensuring the continuity of children's education. Furthermore, the educational activities' sustainability is crucial in the districts where YLF has already been active, as the team has created trust with local families and children.
- **Communication:** Successful interventions require a longer commitment and continuous engagement; the program recognized the importance of regular personal meetings with all stakeholders in all phases of implementing the project activities.
- **Awareness-Raising:** Local ownership is critical to ensuring the efficiency and sustainability of the project; it often takes time and requires a shift in awareness around the issue. The origin training and visits helped local authorities and opinion leaders in the Harvest regions become familiarized with the previously unknown world of seasonal migrant agricultural workers.

Specific successes of the program include:

- “Peer-to-peer” learning opportunities – the farm owners, heads of villages, and opinion leaders who attended the intercultural exchange trip stated that these

sessions resulted in several action plans and increased dialogue between seasonal workers and farmers.

- Collaborating with agricultural intermediaries provided a solid strategic approach to persuading families to send their children to school.
- Videos, brochures and illustrated posters were highly influential in reaching the target audience, especially in training sessions and during awareness-raising events.
- Supporting children's overall well-being, especially younger age groups, which increased their willingness to attend school.
- In-kind support (vouchers to buy food and educational/hygiene materials) has made it more feasible for families to send their children to school.
- Language facilitation in certain regions has increased families' and children's trust and participation in the project.
- Alternative approaches to measuring the children's achievements during the mobile workshops/school period provide essential data for the project's impact assessment.

5. Conclusion and Recommendations (“Looking Ahead”)

“In a Nutshell” has shown solid overall progress and a flexible and responsive approach to changing circumstances. It also has demonstrated its potential to bring about positive change, as many interviewed stakeholders reported that project activities helped them better understand seasonal migrant workers' working conditions and the importance of the elimination of child labor.

The following recommendations are presented for Balsu and YLF:

- **Continue promoting education as a strategy for the elimination of child labor and conducting mobile workshops and summer schools while taking steps to address the program limitations in terms of outreach to children most at risk of child labor:** Many stakeholders recognized the program's success in terms of providing a safe space for younger children during the harvest season, but some interviewees noted the limitations of the educational activities in those ages 12 to 18. School meals and in-kind programs, even scholarships, can have a limited effect in reducing the chances of children entering the workforce at a young age. We also recommend that Balsu and YLF develop models-training systems for children who are out of school to keep them out of agricultural work.

- **Build up transparent and efficient communication channels and enhance cooperation with regional and other sectors' initiatives on the elimination of child labor:** Despite the hazelnut market being highly competitive, the elimination of child labor is the common goal of all related actors, especially in Türkiye's challenging socioeconomic conditions. To enhance cooperation, the following activities would support the program and increase its efficiency: mapping existing projects and interventions on child labor, promoting cross-sectoral collaboration, sharing good practices, and holding more frequent coordination meetings.
- **Strengthen child monitoring activities in the city of origin and continue enhancing cooperation with district commissions of the Ministry of National Education to promote education by continuous monitoring:** The program successfully keeps and monitors the data of children who directly benefited from the intervention. However, the project's long-term impact depends on how children will be kept in the education system through monitoring activities in the city of their origin. The project aims to monitor 500 children from harvest activities to their town of birth. These monitoring activities are often done through telephone calls and school visits. The Ministry of National Education also has district commissions to monitor seasonal agriculture workers' children. Cooperation between different public authorities and the project implementing partner already exists but could be consolidated. Continuous cooperative follow-up with the children by public authorities and the YLF might allow them to remain in school longer.
- **Facilitate communication or a dialogue platform between schools and teachers in the Black Sea region and southeastern Türkiye.** Although the schools and teachers participating in the educational activities were highly appreciative of the "In a Nutshell" program, they also raised concerns about only being active locally and not knowing what was happening in the other regions. As some teachers are already experienced in teaching seasonal migrant workers' children, creating more opportunities for experience sharing should be considered. Therefore, the program has an excellent opportunity to create a network between the summer and winter instructors and schools to share their experiences and facilitate monitoring activities.
- **Continue promoting collaboration among different public authorities for the improvement of temporary settlement areas:** It can be seen from the YLF's MEAL reports and focused assessment interviews that the conditions of the temporary settlement areas and accommodation facilities are vital subjects that were highlighted as critical by seasonal workers and their children. Given the importance of the subject and based on seasonal workers' feedback, Balsu and the YLF could engage with more public authorities and document the accommodations. Also, mapping unused buildings and areas could be an option to turn them into educational facilities.

- **Explore opportunities for engaging a higher number of the same children (participating in activities) in cooperation with the Ministry of Education and other NGOs in the region to ensure the continuity of educational services.** Furthermore, since the YLF has two years' worth of data, it might prioritize monitoring these children to evaluate the program's impact for the following years.
- **Consider using workers' profile data in future programming and following up on trends in child labor; increase synergies between child labor elimination activities and internal monitoring.** For example, the YLF MEAL reports show specific trends in child labor, such as increased school drop-out rates, children without family supervision during the harvest, and an increased number of child laborers.
- **Create impact indicators and an exit strategy for the medium to long-term program.** The program does not yet have impact indicators or an exit strategy. However, cooperation between the governmental agencies and civil society is highly promising. This could open space for Balsu and the YLF to cooperate with the government to see the program's impact. By further collaborating with schools, absenteeism, school attendance rates, or success story case studies could be monitored, and further data attained for future evaluation.

6. Annex 1

Table 7: Focused Assessment Questions and Criteria

Section	Comments
Relevance	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Are the developed program activities relevant to achieving the “In a Nutshell” objective? • Do the program activities address the target group’s core capacity development problem(s)?
Effectiveness	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Will the program activities achieve the objectives and indicators? • Have the activities been completed satisfactorily? • Were there unintended positive and/or negative results, and if so, were they resolved?
Efficiency	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Is the program using the resources appropriately to achieve outcomes?
Strategy and Project Management	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Strategy: Is there a clear and reasonable strategic orientation? • Cooperation: Is there a clear understanding of with whom the program will be cooperating and how? • Monitoring and Evaluation: Is there an operational structure?

Lessons Learned	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • What are the findings from program activities and identified successes and challenges? • What recommendations can be drawn from the project's lessons?
Strategic Orientation	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • How likely is it that the program goals, indicators and results will contribute to Balsu's efforts to prevent child labor during the 2022 harvest? • What are the possible challenges in achieving the program goals? • What recommendations can support program goals and ensure the best possible developmental impact?

Table 8: Outline of Project Activities

Areas	Activities
Diyarbakır	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • 161 household visits conducted in Diyarbakır; • 345 children registered in Bağlar, Çermik, Ergani, Karapınar, and Yenişehir; • 81 children identified as at risk of child labor; and • 17 children directed to formal education.
Mardin	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • 47 household visits conducted in Mardin; • 154 children registered in Mazdağı and Derik; • 141 children identified as at risk of child labor; and • 92 children directed to formal education.
Diyarbakır-Mardin	Between March 15 and 17, selected opinion leaders, village heads, and farm owners from the cities of Sakarya, Düzce, Ordu, Sakarya, Samsun, and Zonguldak, and Balsu's and YLF's teams visited Diyarbakır and Mardin for intercultural interaction and awareness-raising. Over 50 people met representatives of public institutions, schools and visited seasonal workers in their homes.
	Thirty agricultural labor intermediaries attended the agricultural labor intermediary trainings and were certified by ISKUR.
	Women's health and hygiene trainings were organized in several locations, with a total of 126 women participating in the trainings. Twenty women were selected for role model meetings, which were conducted between April 10 and May 14, 2022 and featured topics selected from the Women's Needs Assessment.
Online	Eight teachers from Black Sea region and nine teachers from Mardin and Diyarbakır participated in teachers' orientation trainings.
Düzce, Giresun, Ordu, Sakarya, Samsun	The YLF team visited seasonal worker families in tents, settlement areas, and other accommodations: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • 224 families in Düzce;

	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • 61 families in Giresun; • 433 families in Ordu; • 457 families in Sakarya; and • 146 families in Samsun.
	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • 232 agricultural labor intermediaries in five targeted cities were identified and contacted. • 3,149 children from 1,321 families were registered in the 2022 harvest.
	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • 2,154 children attended educational programs at mobile workshops; • 23 children attended educational programs at summer schools; and • 123 children attended both mobile workshops and summer schools.
	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • 2,047 children were monitored until September 30, 2022; and • 45 children were directed to formal or non-formal education after the 2022 harvest.